INSTRUCTION SHEET FOR TURNING IN PAPERS

Name:_____ Word count (including notes and references):____

- Please fill in this sheet and attach it to your paper at the *back*.
- Your name should *not* appear within the paper or on any cover page.
- Please give me your paper (with this sheet attached) at the *beginning* of the class on the due date.
- Please grade your paper by following the instructions below. You will get a bonus of half a grade (e.g., from AB to A) if my grading of the paper (before the bonus) corresponds exactly to yours.

STEP 1: DOES THE PAPER GET A PASSING GRADE?

1. Does the paper formulate clearly an *acceptable* thesis?   ☐ Yes   ☐ No
2. Does the paper defend the thesis by means of at least one argument
   different from every argument formulated in class or in the required readings?   ☐ Yes   ☐ No
3. Does the paper formulate at least one objection and provide a reply?   ☐ Yes   ☐ No
4. Does the paper address explicitly (at any stage in the argumentation)
   at least one point made in the required readings (or in a philosophy journal article)?   ☐ Yes   ☐ No

If you answered "no" to any of the above four questions, *stop*: the paper grade is F. Otherwise, continue.

STEP 2: ARGUMENTATION SCORE

1. Please score all nine required arguments (circle the corresponding box in each table below):

ARGUMENT FOR THESIS	Justification				OBJECTION 1	Justification				REPLY 1	Justification		
	Unaccep.	Average	Proficient			Unaccep.	Average	Proficient			Unaccep.	Average	Proficient
Reas — Unaccep.	0	1	2		Reas — Unaccep.	0	1	2		Reas — Unaccep.	0	1	2
Average	1	3	4		Average	1	3	4		Average	1	3	4
Proficient	2	4	5		Proficient	2	4	5		Proficient	2	4	5

REJOINDER 1	Justification				RESPONSE 1	Justification				OBJECTION 2	Justification		
	Unaccep.	Average	Proficient			Unaccep.	Average	Proficient			Unaccep.	Average	Proficient
Reas — Unaccep.	0	1	2		Reas — Unaccep.	0	1	2		Reas — Unaccep.	0	1	2
Average	1	3	4		Average	1	3	4		Average	1	3	4
Proficient	2	4	5		Proficient	2	4	5		Proficient	2	4	5

REPLY 2	Justification				REJOINDER 2	Justification				RESPONSE 2	Justification		
	Unaccep.	Average	Proficient			Unaccep.	Average	Proficient			Unaccep.	Average	Proficient
Reas — Unaccep.	0	1	2		Reas — Unaccep.	0	1	2		Reas — Unaccep.	0	1	2
Average	1	3	4		Average	1	3	4		Average	1	3	4
Proficient	2	4	5		Proficient	2	4	5		Proficient	2	4	5

If the paper includes extra arguments, please label and score them below:

	Justification					Justification					Justification		
	Unaccep.	Average	Proficient			Unaccep.	Average	Proficient			Unaccep.	Average	Proficient
Reas — Unaccep.	0	1	2		Reas — Unaccep.	0	1	2		Reas — Unaccep.	0	1	2
Average	1	3	4		Average	1	3	4		Average	1	3	4
Proficient	2	4	5		Proficient	2	4	5		Proficient	2	4	5

2. Please compute the *argumentation score*: _____ (a number from 0 to 5, not necessarily an integer; defined as the average of the scores of all arguments in the paper, assuming that any absent required arguments are present with a score of 0).

STEP 3: PAPER GRADE

1. Please write down the argumentation score (computed in Step 2) in the corresponding empty box below. Then score each of the remaining five dimensions with 0 (unacceptable), 0.5 (average), or 1 (proficient), and write down the scores in the corresponding empty boxes below.

Organization (10%)	Content (60%)		Writing (30%)		
	Argumentation (50%)	Originality (10%)	Clarity (10%)	Conciseness (10%)	Precision/language (10%)

2. Please compute the sum of the numbers you wrote in the six (initially empty) boxes above and round up or down this sum to the nearest integer. The result is the *paper score*, an integer from 0 to 10. Please circle the boxes corresponding to the paper score and the paper grade below:

Paper score	0-1	2	3-4	5	6-7	8-10
Paper grade	D	C	BC	B	AB	A

3. Recall that the paper grade cannot exceed D if the score for clarity is 0 (unacceptable).